

REPORT OF THE REVIEW  
AND IMPLEMENTATION  
COMMITTEE FOR THE  
REPORT OF THE MANITOBA  
PEDIATRIC CARDIAC  
SURGERY INQUEST





## DEDICATION

The Review and Implementation Committee dedicates this Report to the memory of the 12 infants who died in the pediatric cardiac surgery program at the Winnipeg Health Sciences Centre in 1994, and to their families who, despite having done nothing wrong, have suffered a tragic loss. It is our hope that your loss will protect future generations of children and their families, and that this Report will contribute to preventing similar events from ever occurring in the future.

P R E F A C E



REPORT OF THE REVIEW AND IMPLEMENTATION  
COMMITTEE FOR THE REPORT OF THE MANITOBA  
PEDIATRIC CARDIAC SURGERY INQUEST

MAY 2001

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**PREFACE**

Dedication.....	iii
Table of Contents .....	v
Acknowledgements.....	ix

**CHAPTER ONE**

**THE COMMITTEE'S MANDATE AND OPERATION**

Introduction.....	1
Terms of Reference of the Review and Implementation Advisory Committee.....	2
How the Committee Conducted Its Work.....	3
The Sinclair Report and the Review Committee's Mandate .....	6
Our Message to the Families .....	8

**CHAPTER TWO**

**THE INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT AND THE SEARCH FOR ACCOUNTABILITY**

Introduction.....	11
The Definition of Accountability .....	12
The Changing Nature of Health Care Accountability.....	13
Political Accountability.....	13
Accountability and Regional Health Authorities .....	14
Ministerial Responsibility: The Debate .....	15
Financial Accountability .....	17
Results-based Accountability .....	17
Legal and Professional Accountability .....	18
Hierarchical Accountability within Hospitals.....	19
Manitoba's Largest Hospital: The Health Sciences Centre.....	20
Accountability as "Blaming" Versus Accountability as "Learning" .....	23

TABLE OF CONTENTS

“Customer” Accountability.....	24
Concluding Thoughts.....	25
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b>	
<b>THE RECRUITMENT, SELECTION AND RETENTION OF MEDICAL STAFF</b>	
Introduction.....	27
Hiring the Best Surgeon.....	27
Timely Recruitment.....	28
Adequate Notice by Departing Physicians.....	28
The Use of Search Committees and Recruitment Specialists.....	29
Observing Surgeons at Work.....	29
Teamwork as a Selection Criterion.....	29
Fee Schedules for Surgeons.....	30
The Learning Curve and Staffing New Programs.....	30
Recommendations.....	32
<b>CHAPTER FOUR</b>	
<b>THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTRE: STRUCTURE, LEADERSHIP, CULTURE AND COMMUNICATION</b>	
Introduction.....	35
Structure and Accountability.....	35
Program Management Model.....	36
Child Health Program Management Team.....	37
Teamwork and Nurses.....	39
Program Teams.....	39
Being Heard: The Voice of Nurses and the Nursing Council.....	41
Culture, Climate and Leadership at HSC.....	42
Creating the Learning Organization.....	43
Critical Incident Reports.....	45
Quality Assurance.....	46
Quality Assurance at HSC.....	47
A Child Health Program Quality Initiative.....	49
Risk Management.....	49
Risk Management at HSC.....	51
The Patient Experience at HSC.....	52
The Patients’ Representative Office at HSC.....	53
The Executive of the HSC.....	55
Concluding Thoughts.....	56
Recommendations.....	57
<b>CHAPTER FIVE</b>	
<b>THE ISSUE OF INFORMED CONSENT</b>	
Introduction.....	59
Levels of Informed Consent.....	60
Clarifying the Concept of Informed Consent.....	60
Informed Refusal.....	60

Trends in the Matter of Informed Consent.....	62
Patient-Physician Consultation .....	63
Medical Education and Consent.....	63
Informed Consent at HSC.....	64
Disclosure of Physician Backgrounds and Experience .....	64
Disciplinary Histories of Physicians .....	66
Measuring and Reporting on the Outcomes of Surgeons and Programs .....	66
Performance Measurement .....	67
Outcome Measures.....	68
Measures and Indicators .....	68
The Right to a Second Opinion .....	71
The Right to an Out-Of-Province Referral and to the Use of an Out-Of Province Surgeon .....	72
Some Thoughts on Patient Rights .....	74
Some Final Thoughts on Professional Self-Regulations, Informed Consent, Outcomes and Patient Rights .....	76
Recommendations .....	76

**CHAPTER SIX**

**THE DUTY OF LOYALTY VERSUS THE DUTY TO INFORM**

Introduction.....	79
Whistleblowing .....	79
Culture of Silence .....	80
Internal Disclosure.....	82
Policy on Internal Disclosure.....	83
Provincial Whistleblowing Legislation? .....	84
Recommendations .....	86

**CHAPTER SEVEN**

**THE OFFICE OF THE CHIEF MEDICAL EXAMINER (OCME)**

Introduction.....	87
The Sinclair Report’s Findings.....	88
Judge Sinclair’s Recommendations .....	89
Centralization of Forensic Pathology.....	91
Recommendations .....	93

**CHAPTER EIGHT**

**THE COLLEGE OF PHYSICIANS AND SURGEONS OF MANITOBA (CPSM)**

Introduction.....	95
The Role of the Standards Committees.....	96
The Complaints / Investigation Process of the CPSM .....	98
Physicians’ Responsibility for Disclosing Professional Problems of Colleagues .....	103
A Possible Role for “Physician Profiles”? .....	103
The Importance of Continuing Medical Education.....	107
Recommendations .....	109

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER NINE**

**THE FUTURE OF PEDIATRIC CARDIAC SURGERY AND THE WESTERN CANADIAN CHILDREN’S HEART NETWORK (WCCHN)**

Introduction .....	111
Pediatric Cardiac Surgery in Western Canada .....	112
The Western Canadian Children’s Heart Network .....	112
The Role of Telemedicine in the WCCHN .....	113
Outcomes Data from the WCCHN .....	113
The Health Sciences Centre and the WCCHN .....	113
Itinerant Surgeons and the WCCHN .....	114
Support for Patients and Families Using the WCCHN .....	114
Recommendations .....	115

**CHAPTER TEN**

**THE ROLE OF MANITOBA HEALTH: ITS PRESENT AND FUTURE ROLE**

Introduction .....	117
Accountability and the Regional Health Authorities .....	118
The Transformation of Manitoba Health .....	119
Future Directions .....	121
Recommendations .....	122

**CHAPTER ELEVEN**

**CONCLUSIONS AND SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS**

Introduction .....	125
Responsiveness and Accountability in the Health Care System .....	128
The Competence of Health Care Providers .....	129
The Experiences of Patients and Families .....	132
Final Thoughts .....	134
Summary of Committee Recommendations .....	135
The Pediatric Cardiac Surgery Inquest Report, Chapter 10 – Findings and Recommendations Summary of Report Recommendations .....	142

<b>APPENDIX A • Review Committee Biographies .....</b>	<b>149</b>
--	------------

<b>APPENDIX B • Advisory Committee Members and Other Participants .....</b>	<b>151</b>
---	------------

<b>APPENDIX C • Nursing Practice Council – Health Sciences Centre .....</b>	<b>153</b>
---	------------

<b>APPENDIX D • Reporting of Critical Incidents – Health Sciences Centre .....</b>	<b>157</b>
--	------------

<b>APPENDIX E • Whistle Blowing – United States .....</b>	<b>163</b>
---	------------

<b>APPENDIX F • Whistle Blowing – United Kingdom .....</b>	<b>167</b>
--	------------

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

<b>APPENDIX I • Web sites by Reference Topic .....</b>	<b>171</b>
--	------------



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Review and Implementation Committee (Review Committee) could not have understood the complicated issues involved and completed its work in a reasonable period of time without the support of many people.

The Review Committee wishes to begin by thanking the ten families who met with us to discuss the deaths of their children, the Inquest process and their assessments of the recommendations made by Judge Sinclair. We address the families directly in the text of our Report, but we wish to also thank them here for sharing their stories and providing us with insights which we could not obtain elsewhere. We realize the process of talking to strangers about these tragic and disturbing events was not easy. We hope that the families will accept the Dedication at the front of this Report as an expression of our sympathy and admiration for them. The list of the families whom we met is printed below.

The Review Committee benefited from the specialized knowledge and experience of a large Advisory Committee representing most of the leading institutions involved with the events which were under investigation during the Inquest process. We would like to thank our colleagues for their assessments of the recommendations in the Inquest Report, their advice on related matters, and the provision of additional material when it was requested. We can honestly say that all the individuals and institutions involved were accessible and helpful, despite the possibility that we would end up being critical of their actions. We were impressed by the willingness of the members of the Advisory Committee to be open and candid in the presence of professional colleagues from other institutions. The members of the Advisory Committee and other participants in the Review Committee process are listed in Appendix B.

The Review Committee met with a number of individuals and organizations and received written submissions from others. This material was valuable to the Committee because it offered either first-hand knowledge of the health care system and/or passionate advocacy of the necessity for change.

## A C K N O W L E D G E M E N T S

The Review Committee met a number of times with the Minister of Health, the Honourable Dave Chomiak, M.L.A., and the Acting Deputy Minister of Health, Ron Hikel. We wish to thank them for selecting us to undertake this challenging assignment, for their support throughout the past four months, and for respecting the independence of the Committee to allow it to reach its own judgements on the issues.

The Committee had the services of Guy Corriveau, a recent Masters Graduate in Public Administration, who located reference sources and prepared the select bibliography at the end of the Report. The Committee expresses its appreciation to Mr. Corriveau for his excellent work.

Lori Burrows of Manitoba Health supported the Committee in a very professional and dedicated manner. She coordinated the flow of paper and typed successive drafts of the Report. Her work was crucial in enabling the Committee to complete its task in a timely manner, and we express our sincere appreciation.

Last, but far from least, the Committee wishes to thank most sincerely Tom McCormack, Senior Policy Advisor in Manitoba Health, who provided both insightful advice on the issues, along with excellent administrative support. While serving as Secretary to the Committee, Mr. McCormack continued his regular departmental duties and juggled numerous assignments with exemplary professional knowledge, skills and commitment. Put quite simply, the Committee could not have done its work without him, and we wish to express our admiration and gratitude for his efforts.

Linde Feakes

Barbara Petkau

Walter Petkau

Danica Terziski

Sara Tena

Benedict Capilli

Donna Still

Shirley Still

Laurie Maguire

Barbara Maguire

Richard Shumila

Emily Ulimaumi

Mary Kay Pameolik

Sheena Goyal

Vipan Goyal

Charlotte Caribou

Morris Dell