JOURNALS

OF THE

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

OF

MANITOBA



Printed by Order of the Legislative Assembly

5TH SESSION OF THE 40TH LEGISLATURE

From the $16^{\rm TH}$ Day of November 2015 to the $15^{\rm TH}$ Day of March 2016

In the $64^{\text{th}}-65^{\text{th}}\,$ years of the Reign of our Sovereign Lady Queen Elizabeth The Second

WINNIPEG, MANITOBA

VOLUME 163

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA



Lieutenant Governor of Manitoba	Hon. Janice FILMON
Speaker of the Legislative Assembly	Hon. Daryl Reid
Deputy Speaker /	
Chairperson of Committees of the Whole	Ms. Jennifer HOWARD
Deputy Chairpersons of Committees of the Whole	Mr. Rob Altemeyer
	Mr. Jim MALOWAY
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly	Ms. Patricia Снаусник
Deputy Clerk of the Legislative Assembly	Mr. Rick YARISH
Clerk Assistant/Journals Clerk	Mr. Claude MICHAUD
Clerk Assistant/Committee Clerks	Ms. Monique GRENIER
	Mr. Andrea SIGNORELLI
Clerk Assistant/Research Officer	Mr. Greg RECKSIEDLER
Translators	Mr. Alexandre COUTU
	Ms. Carole DAGENAIS
	Ms. Annick Kieffert
	Ms. Louise LAFONTAINE
	Mr. Youness MOUSTARZAK



Janice FILMON

Lieutenant Governor

PROVINCE OF MANITOBA

ELIZABETH II, Queen of Canada

PROCLAMATION

With the advice and consent of the Executive Council of Manitoba, we prorogue the 4th Session of the 40th Legislature of the Province of Manitoba on Sunday, November 15, 2015, and convene the 5th Session of the 40th Legislature of the Province of Manitoba on Monday, November 16, 2015, at 1:30 p.m.

HER HONOUR JANICE FILMON Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Manitoba Winnipeg, Manitoba November 4, 2015

Honourable Gord MACKINTOSH Minister of Justice and Attorney General

TO THE

JOURNALS

VOLUME 163

FIFTH SESSION, FORTIETH LEGISLATURE

64-65 ELIZABETH II, 2015-2016

Noved by Ms. Lathlin, seconded by Ms. Howard	
Debate: Ms. Lathlin, Ms. Howard and Mr. Pallister. Amendment – Mr. Pallister. Ruled in order. Debate continued (amendment): Hon. Mr. Ashton and Messrs. Helwer and Gaudreau. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. Gaudreau	
Debate continued (amendment): Messrs. Gaudreau, Martin, Marcelino (Tyndall Park) and Cullen, Hon. Mr. Kostyshyn and Mr. Piwniuk. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. Piwniuk	
Debate continued (amendment): Mr. PIWNIUK, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX, Messrs. FRIESEN, WIEBE and GRAYDON and Ms. ALLAN. Allowed to remain in the name of Ms. ALLAN.	•••••
Debate continued (amendment): Leave denied to have the matter remain in the name of Ms. ALLAN; Mrs. Driedger, Hon. Mr. Nevakshonoff, Mr. Wishart and Hon. Mr. Allum. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. Allum	
Debate continued (amendment): Hon. Mr. ALLUM, Mrs. MITCHELSON, Messrs. SWAN and SMOOK, Hon. Ms. MARCELINO (Logan) and Messrs. EWASKO and MALOWAY. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. MALOWAY	
Debate continued (amendment): Mr. JHA (by leave), Mrs. ROWAT, Messrs. MALOWAY and PEDERSEN and Hon. Mr. SARAN. Allowed to remain in the name of Hon. Mr. SARAN	
Debate continued (amendment): Hon. Mr. SARAN, Mrs. STEFANSON and Messrs. RONDEAU, SCHULER, PETTERSEN and GOERTZEN. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. GOERTZEN	
Debate continued (amendment): Messrs. Goertzen and Altemeyer, Hon. Mr. Gerrard, Hon. Ms. Wight, Mr. Eichler and Hon. Mr. Selinger. Negatived, on division (18-32). Main motion – Agreed to, on division (32-19)	
S - GENERAL (see Appendix "A")	
S - NOT ASSENTED TO (see Appendix "C")	

BILLS DEALT WITH IN THE HOUSE - BILL STATUS (see Appendix "D")

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE (see also Motions, Government)

House convened (November 16, 2015)	
Unanimous consent to consider condolence motions on the morning of Thursday, November 26, 2015 from 10:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m.	17
Unanimous consent to waive Private Members' Business for Tuesday, December 1, 2015	17
Unanimous consent to consider condolence motions on the morning of Tuesday, December 1, 2015 from 10:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m.	17
Unanimous consent to waive Rules 31(2) and 31(3) regarding the timing for submission and prioritizing of Private Members' Resolutions with the understanding that the time frames for submission and prioritization will be determined by the House Leaders	17
Unanimous consent to defer putting the question on the amendment to the Address in reply to the Speech from the Throne from Wednesday, November 25, 2015 to Thursday, November 26, 2015 at 4:30 p.m.	19
Unanimous consent to waive quorum calls and any recorded votes arising in the House on Wednesday, November 25, 2015	19
Unanimous consent to allow the House to recess temporarily on the afternoon of November 25, 2015 for the arrival of the Grey Cup with the understanding that the day will count as a day of debate for the Throne Speech in spite of the interruption	26
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Transparency Lacking in Routing of Manitoba-Minnesota Transmission Line Resolution would be considered next Thursday, December 3, 2015	31
Unanimous consent to allow Bills (No. 2) and (No. 7) moved for Second Reading, to allow a 15 minute question period after the Minister's opening remarks and to allow Members who had previously spoken to the Bills to speak again	36
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Protecting Strong Public Health Care Resolution would be considered on the next Tuesday of Private Members' Business	40
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Manitoba Needs a Social License for Agriculture Resolution would be considered on the next Thursday of Private Members' Business	54
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Broken Trust Means Higher Hydro Rates Resolution would be considered next Thursday, March 3, 2016	72
House to deal with Concurrence and Third Reading of Bill (No. 300) and Second Reading of Bill (No. 207) (by leave)	77
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Advancing Gender Equality and Women's Rights Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, March 8, 2016	81
House to deal with Second Readings of Bills (No. 202) and (No. 205) (by leave)	85
Rule 31(9) – the Opposition House Leader announced that the Attempted Transgression for Tiger Dams Purchase Resolution would be considered next Thursday, March 10, 2016	87

88

Report Stage Amendment to Bill (No. 8) – withdrawal of proposed amendment to Clause 14 sponsored by Hon. Ms. Braun (by leave)

House to deal with Second Reading of Bill (No. 200) and debate on Second Reading of Bill (No. 207) (by leave)	. 92
Rule 31(8) – the Government House Leader announced that the Steady Progress on Health Care, Education and Jobs Resolution would be considered next Tuesday, March 15, 2016	. 92
Unanimous consent to have the Standing Committee on Rules of the House meet at 3:00 p.m. on Wednesday, March 9, 2016, concurrently with the House	. 93
House to deal with Concurrence and Third Reading of Bill (No. 22) (by leave)	. 124
Unanimous consent to bring forward a motion to concur in the committee report of the Standing Committee of the Rules of the House.	. 124
COMMITTEES OF THE HOUSE	
JUSTICE	
First Report – (Bill Nos. 8, 11, 33 and 300) presented	. 62-66
LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS	
First Report (Recommendation for the appointment of the Conflict of Interest Commissioner and Information and Privacy Adjudicator) presented	
including the Fort Whyte by-election, September 4, 2012; December 31, 2013; Permanent Voters List Study dated June 2013) presented	. 58-60
RULES OF THE HOUSE	
First Report – (Amendments to the Rules, Orders and Forms of Proceedings of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba) presented	. 105-117
SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT	
First Report – (Annual Report of the Manitoba Poverty Reduction and Social Inclusion Strategy (all Aboard) for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2014) presented Second Report – (Bill Nos. 2 and 7) presented Third Report – (Bill Nos. 5, 13, 15, 17 and 18) presented	. 61-62
COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY	
House in (Interim Supply)	. 119
Report presented (March 10, 2015): Interim Supply [\$4,475,000,000.00 – Part A (Operating Expenditure)] and [\$563,100,000.00 – Part B (Capital Investment)] adopted	. 119
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (see also Appendices "A", "B", "C" and "D")	
House in	. 103
Bill (No. 22) – The Elections Amendment Act (Signatures Required for Nomination Document)/Loi modifiant la Loi électorale (nombre de signatures exigées sur les documents de mise en candidature)	
Considered and reported without amendment (by leave)	. 103

House in	120
Bill (No. 23) – The Interim Appropriation Act, 2016/Loi de 2016 portant affectation anticipée	
de crédits Considered and reported without amendment	120
CONDOLENCES	
To the family of the late:	
SHERMAN, Louis Ralph (Bud)	
Speakers: Hon. Mr. Allum, Mr. Pallister, Hon. Mr. Ashton, Mrs. Stefanson, Messrs. Gaudreau and Goertzen and Hon. Mr. Gerrard	38
Toupin, René	
Speakers: Hon. Messrs. Selinger, Gerrard and Ashton, Mr. Pedersen, Hon. Mr. Chomiak, Messrs. Struthers and Jha, Ms. Allan, Ms. Howard, Hon. Ms. Braun and	
Messrs. Goertzen and Altemeyer	30
Trueman, Inez Speakers: Hon. Mr. Ashton, Mrs. Stefanson, Ms. Howard, Hon. Mr. Gerrard and Mr. Goertzen	38
DIVISIONS CONCURRENCE AND THIRD READINGS	
CONCURRENCE AND THIRD READINGS	
Bill (No. 18) – March 15, 2016 Agreed to, on division (53-0)	127-128
OTHER	
Address in Reply to Throne Speech – Amendment – November 26, 2015 Negatived, on division (18-32)	31-33
Address in Reply to Throne Speech – Main Motion – November 26, 2015 Agreed to, on division (32-19)	33-34
Opposition Day Motion – National referendum to change the federal voting system – March 9, 2016	
Negatived, on division (19-32)	101-102
Opposition Day Motion – Urge the Provincial Government to bring forward the 2016/2017 provincial budget – March 14, 2016	
Negatived, on division (17-28)	122-123
DOCUMENTS TABLED - NOT SESSIONAL PAPERS (see Appendix "E")	
FEES, REFUND OF	
Ordered by House re: Bill 300 (by leave)	103-104

GRIEVANCE, MATTERS OF	
Mr. Friesen – Government spending and budget forecasts	36
Mr. WISHART – Condition of Child & Family Services in Manitoba	
Mr. Eichler – Various constituency issues	
Mr. Piwniuk – Rural Health Concerns.	
Mr. Cullen – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mr. PEDERSEN – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mrs. MITCHELSON – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mr. Briese – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mr. Ewasko – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mr. Graydon – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mr. Martin – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mr. SCHULER – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mrs. Stefanson – Government's refusal to deliver a proper budget	
Mrs. Rowat – Health Care case concerns	
Mr. GOERTZEN – NDP claims of needing more time	126
INTERSESSIONAL AND SESSIONAL PAPERS (see Appendices "F" and "G")	
LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR	
Convenes Legislature (November 16, 2015)	
Presents Speech from the Throne (November 16, 2015)	1-12
Assented to Bills:	
March 15, 2016	128-129
MEMBERS' STATEMENTS (see Appendix "I") MESSAGES, BILLS (see also Appendices "A", "C" and "G") Bill (No. 4) – S.P. No. 5 Bill (No. 5) – S.P. No. 14 Bill (No. 13) – S.P. No. 12 Bill (No. 15) – S.P. No. 13 Bill (No. 18) – S.P. No. 15	76 67 73
MINISTERIAL STATEMENTS (see Appendix "J") MOTIONS, GOVERNMENT – RESOLVED	
Adjournment of House (Hon. Mr. SELINGER)	13
Concurrence Motion to the First Report of the Standing Committee on the Rules of the House (by leave) (Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK)	
Debate: Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK, Mr. GOERTZEN, and Hon. Messrs. GERRARD and CHOMIAK. Agreed to	124
Fees paid with respect to Bill (No. 300) – The Mount Carmel Clinic Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur la « Mount Carmel Clinic », be refunded, less the cost of printing (Mr. SWAN) (by leave)	
Debate: Messrs. Swan and Goertzen and Hon. Mr. Gerrard. Agreed to	103-104

Interim Supply [\$4,475,000,000.00 – Part A (Operating Expenditure)] and [\$563,100,000.00 – Part B (Capital Investment)] (Hon. Mr. DEWAR). Agreed to	119
Throne Speech, consideration of (Hon. Mr. SELINGER)	12
OPPOSITION DAY MOTIONS	
National referendum to change the federal voting system (Mr. GOERTZEN) Debate: Messrs. GOERTZEN, SWAN, FRIESEN, GAUDREAU, SMOOK and MALOWAY, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Mr. RONDEAU, Hon. Mr. GERRARD, Mr. SCHULER and Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK. Negatived, on division (19-32)	101-102 122-123
PETITIONS, GENERAL (see Appendix "H")	122-123
PRIVILEGE, MATTERS OF (see SPEAKER'S RULINGS)	
TRIVILLEGE, MATTERS OF (SEE STEARER S RULINGS)	
REPORTS – TABLED INTERSESSIONALLY (see Appendix "F")	
REPORTS – TABLED SESSIONALLY (see Appendix "G")	
REPORT STAGE (see also Appendices "A", "B", "C" and "D")	
(No. 8) -Employment Standards Code Amendment Act (Leave for Victims of Domestic Violence, Leave for Serious Injury or Illness and Extension of Compassionate Care Leave), The/Loi modifiant le Code des normes d'emploi (congé pour les victimes de violence familiale, congé en cas de blessure ou de maladie grave et prolongation du congé de soignant)	
Amendment [#1 – clause 14] – Withdrawn by Hon. Ms. BRAUN (by leave)	88
(No. 18) – The Path to Reconciliation Act/Loi sur la réconciliation Amendment [#1 – clause 5(2)] – Hon. Mr. GERRARD	
Debate: Hon. Mr. GERRARD. Agreed to	126-127
RESOLUTIONS, PRIVATE MEMBERS' – DEBATED	
Advancing Gender Equality and Women's Rights – (No. 5) (Ms. LATHLIN) Debate: Ms. LATHLIN, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Mr. SWAN, Mrs. ROWAT, Hon. Ms. WIGHT and Mrs. MITCHELSON. Allowed to remain in the name of Mrs. MITCHELSON	93-94
Attempted Transgression for Tiger Dams Purchase – (No. 6) (Mr. Helwer) Debate: Messrs. Helwer, Gaudreau and Martin, Hon. Messrs. Ashton, Gerrard and Nevakshonoff and Mr. Marcelino (Tyndall Park). Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. Marcelino (Tyndall Park).	104-105
Broken Trust Means Higher Hydro Rates – (No. 4) (Mr. EICHLER) Debate: Messrs. EICHLER, WIEBE, PEDERSEN, GAUDREAU and EWASKO, Hon. Ms. WIGHT and Mr. MALOWAY. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. MALOWAY	86

Manitoba Needs a Social License for Agriculture – (No. 2) (Mr. Pedersen) Debate: Mr. Pedersen, Hon. Mr. Kostyshyn, Messrs. Eichler, Struthers and Graydon, Hon. Mr. Allum and Mr. Altemeyer. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. Altemeyer.	69-70
Protecting Strong Public Health Care – (No. 3) (Ms. Howard) Debate: Ms. Howard, Mrs. Driedger, Ms. Lathlin, and Messrs. Graydon, Gaudreau, Smook and Piwniuk. Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. Piwniuk	78-79
Steady Progress on Health Care, Education and Jobs – (No. 7) (Mr. Wiebe) Debate: Mr. Wiebe, Mrs. Driedger, Hon. Ms. Wight, Hon. Mr. Gerrard, Mr. Ewasko and Mrs. Stefanson. Allowed to remain in the name of Mrs. Stefanson	125-126
Transparency Lacking in Routing of Manitoba-Minnesota Transmission Line – (No. 1) (Mr. SMOOK) Debate: Messrs. Smook, Rondeau, Eichler, Altemeyer and Pedersen, Hon. Mr. Robinson and Messrs. Pettersen and Marcelino (Tyndall Park). Allowed to remain in the name of Mr. Marcelino (Tyndall Park).	49-50
ROYAL ASSENT	
Assented to Bills: March 15, 2016	128-129
SESSIONAL AND INTERSESSIONAL PAPERS (see Appendices "F" and "G")	
SITTINGS OF THE HOUSE	
House convened (November 16, 2015)	
Pursuant to Rule 2(1), the House adjourned on Thursday, December 3, 2015	54 129
Extended Sittings: March 15, 2016 (5:17 p.m.)	129
SPEAKER'S RULINGS	
OTHER	
Throne Speech – Amendment (Mr. Speaker) Ruled in order	14-15
PRIVILEGE, MATTERS OF	
ISSUES RAISED IN THE $5^{\rm th}$ SESSION OF THE $40^{\rm th}$ LEGISLATURE – RESOLVED	
Privilege (following the Prayer) – Mr. Helwer – regarding unparliamentary language spoken by the Minister of Municipal Government. Contributions: Mr. Helwer and Hon. Mr. Chomiak. Taken under advisement by Mr. Speaker	16
Mr. Speaker did not rule on the matter.	
PROCEDURE	
Interjection – Mr. Speaker – cautioned the Honourable Minister of Jobs and the Economy regarding his comments referencing the absence of Members in the House. Voluntary apology by Hon. Mr. CHIEF	25

Interjection – Mr. Speaker –requested that the words "the class clown of the Legislature" spoken by the Honourable Member for Steinbach be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. GOERTZEN	25
Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "hot friggin clue" spoken by the Honourable Member for Wolseley be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. ALTEMEYER	70
Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the Honourable Minister of Mineral Resources apologize for the use if the words "arrogance, pomposity and phoniness". Apology by Hon. Mr. CHOMIAK	87
Interjection – Mr. Speaker – requested that the words "deliberately misleading" spoken by the Honourable Member for Portage la Prairie be withdrawn. Apology by Mr. WISHART	90
Interjection – Mr. Speaker –requested that the words "learning how to fight a flood of lies" spoken by the Honourable Member for Fort Whyte be withdrawn. Withdrawal by Mr. PALLISTER	122
URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE, MATTERS OF	
Mr. Pedersen – the conduct of Manitoba Hydro towards landowners. *Debate on urgency: Mr. Pedersen, Hon. Mr. Robinson and Hon. Mr. Gerrard (by leave). Mr. Speaker ruled the motion out of order	75-76
Mr. Friesen – the Provincial Government's refusal to table a budget. *Debate on urgency: Mr. Friesen and Hon. Messrs. Chomiak and Gerrard (by leave). Mr. Speaker ruled the motion out of order	99
THRONE SPEECH	
Presented by Her Honour, the Lieutenant Governor (November 16, 2015)	1-12
Ordered to be taken into consideration by the House	12
Address in reply to, amendment November 17, 2015 November 18, 2015 November 19, 2015 November 20, 2015 November 23, 2015 November 24, 2015 November 25, 2015 November 26, 2015	14-15 17-18 20 21-22 23-24 26-27 29 31-34
VOTES	

RECORDED (see Divisions)

WRITTEN QUESTIONS – ACCEPTED AND NOT RETURNED

No. 11 – Advertisement in a community newspaper Question posed on April 23, 2014 by Mr. Schuler (3rd Session, 39th Legislature – Journals, page 211)

No. 12 – Advertisement in a community newspaper Question posed on April 23, 2014 by Mr. Schuler (3^{rd} Session, 39^{th} Legislature – Journals, page 211)

- No. 13 Manitoba Cattle Enhancement Program expenses

 Question posed on May 20, 2014 by Mr. Pedersen (3rd Session, 39th Legislature –

 Journals, page 259)
- No. 14 Statistical information on provincial infrastructure projects since 2007 Question posed on May 21, 2014 by Mr. Helwer (3rd Session, 39th Legislature – Journals, page 261)
- No. 15 Information regarding the repair or the rebuilding of the PR#313 bridge Question posed on June 2, 2014 by Mr. EWASKO (3rd Session, 39th Legislature Journals, page 294)



Janice FILMON

Lieutenant Governor

PROVINCE OF MANITOBA

ELIZABETH II, Queen of Canada

PROCLAMATION

With the advice and consent of the Executive Council of Manitoba, the Fortieth Legislative Assembly is hereby dissolved.

HER HONOUR JANICE FILMON Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Manitoba Winnipeg, Manitoba March 16, 2016

Honourable Gord MACKINTOSH Minister of Justice and Attorney General