

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 51

FIRST SESSION, THIRTY-SEVENTH LEGISLATURE

PRAYERS 1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

Mr. SANTOS, Chairperson of the Committee of Supply, presented the Report of the Proceedings of the Committee of June 22, 2000 as follows:

IN THE COMMITTEE

In the section of the Committee of Supply sitting in Room 255, on Thursday, June 22, 2000, considering the estimates of the Department of Labour, the question was put on line 1(a) – Minister's salary. A voice vote was held, whereupon a counted vote was requested and Members sitting in Room 254 and Room 255 returned to the Chamber. A counted vote was held on the motion, which was passed (25-9).

The following Resolutions were adopted:

3.4 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding FOURTEEN MILLION, NINE HUNDRED FORTY-NINE THOUSAND, EIGHT HUNDRED DOLLARS for AGRICULTURE AND FOOD:

3.5 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding FOURTEEN MILLION, SIX HUNDRED FIFTY THOUSAND DOLLARS for AGRICULTURE AND FOOD:

REGIONAL AGRICULTURAL SERVICES \$14,650,000.00

for the fiscal year ending the 31st day of March, 2001.

11.2 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding THIRTEEN MILLION, SEVEN HUNDRED SIXTY THOUSAND DOLLARS for LABOUR:

for the fiscal year ending the 31st day of March, 2001.

11.3 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding EIGHT MILLION, THREE HUNDRED SIXTY-THREE THOUSAND, THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS for LABOUR:
CITIZENSHIP AND MULTICULTURALISM\$8,363,300.00
for the fiscal year ending the 31st day of March, 2001.
11.4 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding FOUR HUNDRED SEVEN THOUSAND, EIGHT HUNDRED DOLLARS for LABOUR:
AMORTIZATION OF CAPITAL ASSETS\$407,800.00
for the fiscal year ending the 31st day of March, 2001.
14.1 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding TWO MILLION, SIX HUNDRED FORTY-NINE THOUSAND DOLLARS for CULTURE, HERITAGE AND TOURISM:
ADMINISTRATION AND FINANCE \$2,649,000.00
for the fiscal year ending the 31st day of March, 2001.
14.4 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding SEVEN MILLION, THREE HUNDRED FIFTY-ONE THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED DOLLARS for CULTURE, HERITAGE AND TOURISM:
TOURISM
for the fiscal year ending the 31st day of March, 2001.
14.7 RESOLVED that there be granted to HER MAJESTY a sum not exceeding SIX HUNDRED TWENTY-EIGHT THOUSAND, THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS for CULTURE, HERITAGE AND TOURISM:
HUNDRED TWENTY-EIGHT THOUSAND, THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS for CULTURE,
HUNDRED TWENTY-EIGHT THOUSAND, THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS for CULTURE, HERITAGE AND TOURISM:
HUNDRED TWENTY-EIGHT THOUSAND, THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS for CULTURE, HERITAGE AND TOURISM: AMORTIZATION OF CAPITAL ASSETS
HUNDRED TWENTY-EIGHT THOUSAND, THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS for CULTURE, HERITAGE AND TOURISM: AMORTIZATION OF CAPITAL ASSETS

Hon. Ms. MIHYCHUK presented:

Annual Report of the Manitoba Horse Racing Commission for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2000.

(Sessional Paper No. 171)

By leave, Hon. Mr. Selinger introduced Bill (No. 41) – The Balanced Budget, Debt Repayment and Taxpayer Protection Amendment and Consequential Amendments Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'équilibre budgétaire, le remboursement de la dette et la protection des contribuables et modifications corrélatives, and outlined the purposes thereof, it was read a First Time.

(Recommended by His Honour, the Administrator)

Hon. Mr. SELINGER presented:

Message from His Honour, the Administrator recommending the disposition of public revenue for Bill (No. 41).

(Sessional Paper No. 172)

Following Oral Questions, Mr. Speaker made the following rulings:

On June 5, 2000, I took under advisement a point of order raised by the Honourable Deputy Government House Leader concerning the use of the word "misled" by the Honourable Member for Lac du Bonnet. The Deputy Government House Leader asserted that as the word in question appeared on the list of unparliamentary words contained in Beauchesne citation 489, that the use of the word was out of order. The Honourable Official Opposition House Leader also spoke to the point of order, and suggested that the word was not out of order because it appeared on the list of parliamentary words contained in Beauchesne citation 490, and because the Member for Lac du Bonnet had not used the term "deliberately" in conjunction with the word misled. I took the matter under advisement in order to peruse Hansard.

I thank both House Leaders for their contributions to the point of order.

As I ruled in the House on June 8, and again on June 12, 2000, a word is not in or out of order simply because of the appearance of the word on a list of parliamentary or unparliamentary terms. Much depends on the tone used, the context of the situation, and the amount of disorder generated. The guiding principle for Manitoba Speakers to primarily follow is Manitoba precedents, in conjunction with the context of the usage of the word.

Past Manitoba practice has been that if a Member uses the phrase "deliberately misleading", the words are ruled out of order. This is reinforced by rulings from Mr. Speaker Rocan on July 12, 1991, and Madam Speaker Dacquay on March 20, 1997, on April 9, 1997 and June 10, 1997. However, the word in question used by the Member for Lac du Bonnet was misled, which had no qualifier or connotation of deliberately misleading. As was ruled in the House by Madam Speaker Dacquay on October 17, 1995, the word misleading is not considered to be unparliamentary unless it is claimed that the misleading is deliberate. I therefore find that there is no point of order, and that the word misled was not used in an unparliamentary context.

* * *

On June 7, 2000, I took under advisement a point of order raised by the Honourable Government House Leader concerning the use of the words "Minister of Gambling" by the Honourable Member for Morris in addressing a question to the Honourable Minister of Consumer and Corporate Affairs. The Honourable Government House Leader indicated that there was no such Minister. The Official Opposition House Leader also spoke to the point of order, and indicated that it was immaterial whether a Minister was referred to as the Minister responsible for a particular area. The Honourable First Minister also spoke to the point of order. I took the matter under advisement in order to peruse Hansard.

I thank all Members for their contributions to the point of order.

On the matter of the proper reference to Ministers in Question Period, Beauchesne citation 484(1) advises that it is custom in the House that a Minister is normally designated by the porfolio held, such as the Honourable Minister for Consumer and Corporate Affairs. Marleau and Montpetit, on pages 521 and 522 of *House of Commons Procedure and Practice* state that during debate, Members do not refer to one another by their names, but rather by title, position or constituency name in order to guard against all tendency to personalize debate. A Minister is referred to by the portfolio that he or she holds.

Upon checking the title of the Honourable Minister of Consumer and Corporate Affairs on the Order-in-Council appointing the Minister to cabinet, he is listed as being the Minister Responsible for The Gaming Control Act. I would therefore respectfully request that Honourable Members refer to the Minister by his correct title, which is the Honourable Minister Responsible for Gaming or The Gaming Control Act.

Pursuant to Rule 23(1), Ms. CERILLI, Messrs. SCHULER, JENNISSEN, DERKACH and NEVAKSHONOFF made Members' Statements.

Mr. Speaker having left the Chair and the House resolving itself into a Committee to consider of the Supply to be granted to Her Majesty;

And the House continuing in Committee.

The House then adjourned at 6:02 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Tuesday, June 27, 2000.

Hon. George HICKES, Speaker.