



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 21

SECOND SESSION, FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

PRAYER AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

The Speaker tabled:

To Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor in Council:

We, Nahanni FONTAINE and Renée CABLE, Members of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba, hereby give notice that a vacancy exists in the representation in the Legislative Assembly, of the Electoral Division of Transcona, due to the passing of Nello ALTOMARE the Member elected in this electoral division.

Pursuant to section 25 of *The Legislative Assembly Act*, we request Your Honour in Council to pass an order-in-council for the filling of the vacancy in the representation of this electoral division in the Legislative Assembly under the provisions of *The Elections Act*.

Dated at Winnipeg this 15th day of January 2025.

(Signed) Nahanni Fontaine
Member of the Legislative Assembly

Renée Cable
Member of the Legislative Assembly

(Sessional Paper No. 7)

The Speaker tabled:

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

To the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly,

I, Robert LOISELLE, Member of the Legislative Assembly for the Electoral Division of St. Boniface, do hereby submit my resignation as Deputy Chairperson of the Committees of the Whole House.

Dated this 4th day of March 2025.

(Signed) Robert Loisel
(Sessional Paper No. 8)

The following Bills were read a First Time and had their purposes outlined:

(No. 6) – The Public Schools Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les écoles publiques
(Hon. Min. SCHMIDT)

(No. 16) – The Municipal Councils and School Boards Elections Amendment and Public Schools Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les élections municipales et scolaires et la Loi sur les écoles publiques
(Hon. Min. SCHMIDT)

(No. 7) – The Human Tissue Gift Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les dons de tissus humains
(Hon. Min. ASAGWARA)

(No. 8) – The Liquor, Gaming and Cannabis Control Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur la réglementation des alcools, des jeux et du cannabis
(Hon. Mr. WIEBE)

(No. 9) – The Liquor, Gaming and Cannabis Control Amendment Act (2)/Loi n° 2 modifiant la Loi sur la réglementation des alcools, des jeux et du cannabis
(Hon. Mr. WIEBE)

(No. 11) – The Oil and Gas Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur le pétrole et le gaz naturel
(Hon. Mr. MOSES)

(No. 12) – The Housing and Renewal Corporation Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur la Société d'habitation et de rénovation
(Hon. Ms. SMITH)

(No. 14) – The Insurance Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les assurances
(Hon. Min. SALA)

(No. 15) – The Real Estate Services Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les services immobiliers
(Hon. Min. SALA)

Mr. OXENHAM, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Legislative Affairs, presented its Second Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on December 10, 2024 at 1:00 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Advocate for Children and Youth for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

Committee Membership

- Mr. BLASHKO
- MLA COMPTON
- Mrs. COOK
- Hon. Min. FONTAINE
- Mrs. HIEBERT
- Mr. OXENHAM

Your Committee elected Mr. OXENHAM as the Chairperson.

Your Committee elected Mr. BLASHKO as the Vice-Chairperson.

Officials Speaking on Record

- Sherry Gott, Manitoba Advocate for Children and Youth

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following report as presented:

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Advocate for Children and Youth for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

On motion of Mr. OXENHAM, the Report of the Committee was received.

Mr. OXENHAM, Vice-Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Legislative Affairs, presented its Third Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on December 11, 2024 at 10:00 a.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Appointment process for the Manitoba Ombudsman

Committee Membership

- MLA CROSS
- MLA DELA CRUZ
- Mr. JOHNSON
- MLA LOISELLE
- Mr. NESBITT
- Mr. OXENHAM

Your Committee elected MLA DELA CRUZ as the Chairperson.

Your Committee elected Mr. OXENHAM as the Vice-Chairperson.

Motions

Your Committee agreed to the following motions:

- *THAT the Standing Committee on Legislative Affairs recommends to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba that Jill Perron be reappointed as the Manitoba Ombudsman.*
- *THAT the Standing Committee on Legislative Affairs recommends to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba that The Ombudsman Act be updated with gender neutral language.*

On motion of Mr. OXENHAM, the Report of the Committee was received.

MLA DEVGAN, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Crown Corporations, presented its First Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on January 17, 2025 at 1:00 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Hydro-Electric Board for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

Committee Membership

- MLA COMPTON
- MLA DEVGAN
- Mr. GOERTZEN
- Mr. OXENHAM
- Hon. Min. SALA
- Mrs. STONE

Your Committee elected MLA DEVGAN as the Chairperson.

Your Committee elected Mr. OXENHAM as the Vice-Chairperson.

Officials Speaking on Record

- Allan Danroth, President and Chief Executive Officer, Manitoba Hydro-Electric Board
- Ben Graham, Chair of the Board, Manitoba Hydro-Electric Board
- Alastair Fogg, Chief Financial Officer, Manitoba Hydro-Electric Board

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following report as presented:

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Hydro-Electric Board for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

On motion of MLA DEVGAN, the Report of the Committee was received.

Mr. BLASHKO, Vice-Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Crown Corporations, presented its Second Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on January 23, 2025 at 9:00 a.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Public Insurance Corporation for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

Committee Membership

- Mr. BALCAEN
- Mr. BLASHKO
- Hon. Min. CABLE
- Mrs. HIEBERT
- MLA PANKRATZ
- Hon. Mr. WIEBE

Your Committee elected MLA PANKRATZ as the Chairperson.

Your Committee elected Mr. BLASHKO as the Vice-Chairperson.

Non-Committee Members Speaking on Record

- Mrs. COOK

Officials Speaking on Record

- Satvir Jatana, President and Chief Executive Officer, Manitoba Public Insurance Corporation
- Carmen Nedohin, Chair of the Board, Manitoba Public Insurance Corporation

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following report as presented:

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Public Insurance Corporation for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

On motion of Mr. BLASHKO, the Report of the Committee was received.

Mr. BRAR, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Crown Corporations, presented its Third Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on January 28, 2025 at 1:00 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Centennial Centre Corporation for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

Committee Membership

- Mr. BRAR
- Ms. BYRAM
- MLA COMPTON
- Hon. Min. KENNEDY
- MLA LOISELLE
- Mr. PERCHOTTE

Your Committee elected Mr. BRAR as the Chairperson.

Your Committee elected MLA LOISELLE as the Vice-Chairperson.

Officials Speaking on Record

- Robert Olson, President and Chief Executive Officer, Manitoba Centennial Centre Corporation
- Alan Goddard, Board Chair, Manitoba Centennial Centre Corporation

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following report as presented:

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Centennial Centre Corporation for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

On motion of Mr. BRAR, the Report of the Committee was received.

MLA LOISELLE, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Crown Corporations, presented its Fourth Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on January 29, 2025 at 1:00 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Liquor and Lotteries Corporation for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

Committee Membership

- Mr. BLASHKO
- MLA COMPTON
- Mr. KING
- MLA LOISELLE
- Mr. NARTH
- Hon. Mr. SIMARD

Your Committee elected MLA LOISELLE as the Chairperson.

Your Committee elected Mr. BLASHKO as the Vice-Chairperson.

Officials Speaking on Record

- Gerry Sul, President and Chief Executive Officer, Manitoba Liquor and Lotteries Corporation
- Jeff Traeger, Board Chair, Manitoba Liquor and Lotteries Corporation

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following report as presented:

- Annual Report of the Manitoba Liquor and Lotteries Corporation for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

On motion of MLA LOISELLE, the Report of the Committee was received.

Mrs. SCHOTT, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Crown Corporations, presented its Fifth Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on January 31, 2025 at 1:00 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Annual Report of Efficiency Manitoba for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

Committee Membership

- MLA CHEN
- Mr. GUENTER
- Hon. Min. MOYES
- Mr. PIWNIUK
- Mrs. SCHOTT
- Hon. Min. SCHMIDT

Your Committee elected Mrs. SCHOTT as the Chairperson.

Your Committee elected MLA CHEN as the Vice-Chairperson.

Officials Speaking on Record

- Colleen Kuruluk, Chief Executive Officer, Efficiency Manitoba
- Jeannette Montufar-MacKay, Board Chair, Efficiency Manitoba
- Michael Stocki, Vice President of Efficiency Programs, Efficiency Manitoba

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following report as presented:

- Annual Report of Efficiency Manitoba for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024

On motion of Mrs. SCHOTT, the Report of the Committee was received.

Mr. GUENTER, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, presented its First Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on December 12, 2024 at 1:30 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

Matters under Consideration

- Auditor General's Report – Animal Disease Preparedness dated January 2021
- Auditor General's Report – Follow Up of Previously Issued Recommendations dated February 2024
 - *Animal Disease Preparedness*
- Auditor General's Report – Provincial Oversight of Drinking Water Safety dated September 2020
- Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations dated March 2023
 - *Provincial Oversight of Drinking Water Safety*

Committee Membership

- Mr. BRAR
- MLA CHEN
- MLA COMPTON
- MLA DELA CRUZ
- MLA DEVGAN
- Mr. GUENTER (*Chairperson*)
- MLA LAMOUREUX
- MLA MALOWAY (*Vice-Chairperson*)
- Mr. NESBITT
- Mr. OXENHAM
- Mrs. STONE

Officials Speaking on Record

- Tyson Shtykalo, Auditor General of Manitoba
- Maurice Bouvier, Assistant Deputy Minister of Industry Advancement, Department of Agriculture
- Glen Duizer, Chief Veterinary Officer
- Jocelyn Baker, Deputy Minister of Environment and Climate Change
- Elliott Brown, Assistant Deputy Minister of Environment and Climate Change
- Sacha Janzen, Acting Director, Office of Drinking Water, Department of Environment and Climate Change

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following reports as presented:

- Auditor General's Report – Animal Disease Preparedness dated January 2021
- Auditor General's Report – Provincial Oversight of Drinking Water Safety dated September 2020

Your Committee completed consideration of the following chapters as presented:

- Auditor General's Report – Follow-Up of Previously Issued Recommendations dated March 2023
 - *Provincial Oversight of Drinking Water Safety*
- Auditor General's Report – Follow Up of Previously Issued Recommendations dated February 2024
 - *Animal Disease Preparedness*

On motion of Mr. GUENTER, the Report of the Committee was received.

The Speaker tabled:

Report of the Ethics Commissioner's inquiry into the compliance of Hon. Mr. KINEW with *The Conflict of Interest (Members and Ministers) Act*, dated February 19, 2025, pursuant to the request by Mr. WASYLIW on December 2, 2024.

(Sessional Paper No. 9)

Hon. Mr. KOSTYSHYN, the Minister of Agriculture, made a statement regarding the Third Anniversary of the Invasion of Ukraine.

Mr. PERCHOTTE and, by leave, MLA LAMOUREUX commented on the statement.

Pursuant to sub-rule 28(1), Messrs. BRAR and JACKSON, MLA LAMOUREUX and Messrs. GUENTER and WASYLIW made Member's statements.

Following Oral Questions, the Speaker made the following rulings:

Following the Land Acknowledgement on December 2, 2024, the Honourable Member for Fort Garry raised a matter of contempt alleging that the Premier had failed to provide a response to a matter taken under advisement in the Committee of Supply within the deadline set out in the Rules of the House. The Member contended that this failure infringed on his rights as a Member, and he accused the Premier of being in contempt of the Assembly. The Member concluded his remarks by moving:

THAT this House censure the Premier for their disregard for the traditions and practices of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba and their contempt for the people of Manitoba; and

THAT this House order the Premier to produce the information contained in the notice of advisement within 24 hours of the Speaker's ruling.

The Honourable Government House Leader and the Member for Spruce Woods spoke to the matter before I took it under advisement.

As matters of contempt are rarely raised in this House, I will begin by providing some general information for Members. Joseph Maingot states on page 14 of *Parliamentary Privilege in Canada* that contempt can be described as an offense against the authority or dignity of the House. Further, as Bosc and Gagnon note on page 81 of the *House of Commons Procedure and Practice*, the House can claim the right to punish, as a contempt, any action which, though not a breach of specific privileges, tends to obstruct or impede the House in the performance of its functions, obstructs or impedes any Member or officer of the House in the discharge of their duties, or is an offence against the authority and dignity of the House. It is worth noting here that the standard for such a breach is quite high.

In order for a matter of contempt to be ruled as a *prima facie* case, the Member must demonstrate that the issue has been raised at the earliest opportunity while also providing sufficient evidence to support the claim that a contempt of the House has occurred.

On the condition of timeliness, the Member indicated in his submission that December 2, 2024, was his first opportunity to raise this matter in the House. Given that the breach of the Rule as described by the Member occurred after November 29, 2024, I would agree that this was indeed his earliest opportunity to raise this matter.

Regarding the question of evidence, while the Member raised several complaints on this matter, his core allegation was that the Premier failed to respond to the Member's question taken under advisement within 45 days. He argued that this failure breached our Rules regarding matters taken under advisement in the Committee of Supply. The Member further contended that "by refusing to answer questions after claiming the Premier would provide that information, it prevents an MLA from doing their job and holding the Government to account".

For reference our sub-rule 77(16) reads as follows:

During the consideration of departmental estimates and the debate on the concurrence motion in the Committee of Supply, when a Minister takes a question under advisement they must, within 45 days of the question being asked, respond to the question.

The Member is partially correct in his allegation here. As he established in his submission, the 45 days in question here expired two days before he raised this matter. However, the Member also noted in his submission that this same Rule is "silent as to a remedy as to what occurs when a Minister has breached that order". This second point is relevant to my consideration of this situation.

The Standing Committee on Rules of the House adopted the provisions of sub-rule 77(16) on June 26, 2015, and the House subsequently ratified that decision. During the consideration of that Rule, the Committee chose not to include any consequence for failing to meet the 45-day deadline. Accordingly, as the Rule imposes a requirement without a consequence, the Speaker is not provided with a mechanism to respond to a breach. I would also note that while the Rule provides a range of options for Ministers to provide information to a Member, it does not require the Clerk's Office to track the provision for answers to Members. Accordingly, Clerks and the Speaker will not always know if a Minister has met the time limit required by the Rule.

It is important to note here that the basis of the Member's complaint is a breach of a Rule of this House. I reference this because Members should know that any matter concerning the methods by which the House proceeds in the conduct of business would be a question of order, not privilege or contempt. Joseph Maingot, in the second edition of the *Parliamentary Privilege in Canada* states on page 14 that "allegations of breach of privilege by a Member in the House ... that amount to complaints about procedures and practices in the House are by their very nature matters of order". He also states on page 223 of the same edition that "a breach of the Standing Orders or a failure to follow an established practice would invoke a point of order rather than a question of privilege".

With all of this in mind, I could see how not responding to this matter under advisement in a timely manner could be considered discourteous or disrespectful to the Member. However, I would not agree that the Premier was in contempt of the House. Accordingly, after careful consideration, I rule that the Member for Fort Garry did not prove a *prima facie* case of contempt in this matter.

Before I conclude, I will note as well for the record that the information the Member for Fort Garry had requested related to the Premier's attendance at a respectful workplace training seminar. In her response to the Member's matter of contempt submission, the Honourable Government House Leader shared with the House that the Premier attending a respectful workplace training seminar on February 29, 2024. I do not understand why it took 47 days for that information to be shared with the Member and with the House, and I would respectfully request all Ministers be more attentive to such obligations in the future.

I would also note that in my time as a Member of this House, I have observed that Ministers from both parties have sometimes failed to meet the standard set by this rule for providing opposition Members with information in a timely way. While I do not believe that this would be a contempt of the House, I do believe that it is disrespectful. In my opinion, anyone who has earned the privilege of being appointed a Minister of the Crown should aspire to fulfill the obligations of that role to the best of their abilities, including responding in a timely manner to requests for information from other Members of this House.

I thank all Members for their attention to this ruling.

* *

During Private Members' Business on December 5, 2024, the Member for Waverley rose on a point of order alleging that, whilst speaking in debate, the Leader of the Official Opposition used inappropriate language and called into question the impartiality of the Chair.

The Official Opposition House Leader also spoke to the matter before the Deputy Speaker took it under advisement so that the Hansard transcript could be reviewed.

I have reviewed the Hansard transcript for that morning. It is clear to me that certain comments made by the Leader of the Official Opposition were unfortunate and caused some disorder that had to be addressed by the Deputy Speaker on several occasions. However, I do not believe that his comments called into question the impartiality of the Chair, nor were they unparliamentary.

I would therefore rule that the Member for Waverley did not have a point of order.

Having said that, I respectfully request that, in the future, all Members carefully consider their comments before they speak in the House to ensure that what they say cannot be taken as a reflection on the Chair, on the role of the Chair, on the rulings of the Chair, or on the performance of the individuals in the Chair.

Prior to Orders of the Day, Mr. EWASKO rose on a matter of urgent public importance and moved:

THAT in accordance with sub-rule 39(1), the regular business of the House be set aside to discuss a matter of urgent public importance; specifically, the need to protect Manitoba businesses and consumers from the economic impact of American tariffs and to develop a long-term interprovincial trade strategy.

And Mr. EWASKO and Hon. Min. FONTAINE having spoken,

WHEREUPON the Speaker ruled as follows:

I thank Members for their advice to the Chair on the motion proposed by the Honourable Leader of the Official Opposition requesting debate on a matter of urgent public importance.

The 90-minute notice required prior to the start of Routine Proceedings by sub-rule 39(1) was provided, and I thank the Member.

Under our Rules and practices, the subject matter requiring urgent consideration must be so pressing that the public interest will suffer if the matter is not given immediate attention. Crucially, there must also be no other reasonable opportunities to raise the matter.

I have listened very carefully to the arguments put forward. Clearly, the matter of protecting Manitoba businesses and consumers from the economic impact of American tariffs and developing a long-term interprovincial trade strategy is relevant to this House. However, as I noted a moment ago, my duty in this moment is also to determine if there are other opportunities for debate on such matters.

With that in mind I must note that Members have several opportunities to raise this matter:

- They could raise it as a Member's statement
- They could ask questions on this topic during Oral Questions
- They could use their Grievances to speak to this matter
- They could also speak to the Government resolution, on a very similar topic, which is currently on the Notice Paper

Accordingly, I rule this motion out of order as a matter of urgent public importance.

During consideration of the matter of urgent importance, Mr. KHAN rose on a matter of privilege alleging that the Premier and other Members in Cabinet had repeatedly and deliberately misquoted him in debate, impeding his ability to perform his duties, and moved:

THAT the Premier, the Government House Leader, and the Minister of Business, Mining, Trade and Job Creation withdraw their remarks and apologize immediately.

And Hon. Min. FONTAINE having spoken,

WHEREUPON the Speaker ruled there was no matter of privilege.

On motion of Hon. Min. FONTAINE, it was ordered that Diljeet BRAR, Honourable Member for the Electoral Division of Burrows, be Deputy Chairperson of the Committees of the Whole House.

By leave, Hon. Min. FONTAINE moved:

WHEREAS the tariffs by U.S. President Donald Trump threaten Canada's sovereignty and economic security; and

WHEREAS Manitoba is a powerhouse of clean hydroelectricity, critical minerals, and brilliant, hardworking people who drive innovation and prosperity; and

WHEREAS Manitobans look out for each other as it is the Manitoba way; and

WHEREAS now more than ever, the people of this province need to stick together, stand up for each other, and take decisive action to fight for Manitoban jobs, industries and resources; and

WHEREAS Manitobans are stronger standing together; and

WHEREAS Manitobans love Canada; and

WHEREAS Canada will never become the 51st state.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba stands united in defense of the province, its workers, and its industries against President Donald Trump's tariff tax and threats, which threaten Canada's sovereignty and economic security.

And a debate arising,

And Hon. Min. FONTAINE having spoken,

And Mrs. STONE speaking at 5:00 p.m. The debate was allowed to remain in their name.

The House then adjourned at 5:00 p.m. until 10:00 a.m. Thursday, March 6, 2025.

Hon. Tom LINDSEY,
Speaker.