Women and Policing in Canada

A Status Brief and Discussion Paper

September 2014
INTRODUCTION

Throughout the years, there have been efforts to advance women’s equality in many fields of endeavor, including policing. Police organizations have recognized the value of diversity, and have worked to recruit women and other under-represented groups, for example by re-examining standards for qualifying physical tests. However, the data indicate that there has not been an improvement to the rates of women entering policing, including advancing to senior management positions.

In the 1990s and early 2000s, research emerged showing the value and importance of women’s contributions to law enforcement. Since that time, organizations such as the International Association of Women Police (IAWP) and the U.S. Feminist Majority Foundation’s National Centre for Women and Policing have continued to strengthen and raise the profile of women in criminal justice organizations. In 2008 a National Forum on Women in Policing was held in Canada by the Summit Institute, bringing together experts and stakeholders from across the country. Recent research by organizations such as the Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police (CACP) using gender and diversity-disaggregated data indicates important differences that may affect women’s participation and warrant closer attention. New and emerging approaches in some police agencies, for example corporate diversity mainstreaming strategies, demonstrate considerable potential.

Over the past twenty years, shifts in the culture and operations of policing services have taken place in Canada and internationally. This includes movement towards increased civilian oversight of policing services, intelligence-led investigative approaches, and a return to a community-based policing model driven by a philosophy of mutual police-community partnerships. These changes are a result of an evolving social and cultural landscape, technological advances, increasingly diverse populations and complex judicial and ethical issues that require new ways of providing equitable protection and public safety. They represent long-term efforts to shift from a traditionally bureaucratic and militarized approach to policing. Improving diversity in policing services is a necessary component of ensuring success for these new models.

For these reasons, it is timely to reinvigorate dialogue on women in policing and develop solutions to improve and maintain women’s presence in police work. The purpose of this paper is to raise awareness and create discussion on some potential and existing approaches. Building on the success of some recent Canadian initiatives, we can look for the most effective and innovative ways to improve women’s representation, with the ultimate goal of improving public safety for all Canadians.

It is important to note that while this paper articulates the benefits of women to policing, it does not intend to generalize or stereotype the skills and abilities of either gender. Research supports that when diversity (including gender, culture, sexuality, ability) is represented at all levels of an organization, the organization operates more effectively and the desired outcomes of the organization are better achieved. Notably absent in the women and policing research is an intersectional analysis of the unique needs, experiences and contributions of Aboriginal men and women, newcomer and immigrant men and women, men and women of colour and men and women with disabilities. For this reason, there is limited exploration of these issues in this paper. However, the need for such consideration is raised as an approach to consider moving forward.
The Numbers: Women in Policing in Canada

Globally, women represent about 13 per cent of women in policing, which is slightly lower than their representation in Canada. According to Statistics Canada, in 2013, women comprised 20 per cent of all police officers in Canada across all positions and ranks (see below). Quebec’s police services include 24 per cent female representation with British Columbia following at 21.5 per cent. Newfoundland and Labrador and Saskatchewan come in close to the national average at 19 per cent. Of the provinces, Manitoba scores lowest with 15 per cent of police being female, followed closely by New Brunswick at 16 per cent. The Territories score lowest, with women’s representation ranging from 12 to 13.5 per cent in all law enforcement positions.

According to Statistics Canada, in 2013 women made up 10 per cent of senior officers (lieutenant or higher, including chiefs) in police agencies across Canada. Notable differences include Newfoundland and Labrador that had a significantly higher rate with regard to females in senior officer ranks. Of 29 senior officers in that province in 2013, seven (24 per cent) were women. In Prince Edward Island, Yukon and Northwest Territories there are no senior officers (it should be noted, however, that the total number of senior officials in those jurisdictions is quite small at eight, five and six officers respectively). While there are only four officers of senior official rank in Nunavut, in 2013 two (50 per cent) were female. On average, female non-commissioned officers in Canada (staff sergeants, sergeants, detective-sergeants, corporals etc.) are represented slightly higher at 17 per cent, as are female constables at 22 per cent.

Challenges Facing Women in Policing

Women’s participation in non-traditional occupations is often attributed to low levels of interest or ability. There is a perception that women do not want, or do not have the natural skill or ability, to do physically demanding or dangerous work. Contrary to this perception, physical agility has been found not to be a strong predictor of success in law enforcement. Research suggests that a complex range of factors are likely contributing to women’s low levels of participation: recruitment and retention practices, family and work-life balance issues, and gender-based harassment and violence within policing organizations.

Recruitment and Retention Policies:

Progress has been made in developing targeted recruitment programs geared towards women and diversity groups. For example, both the RCMP and the Edmonton Police Service have extensive recruitment materials on their websites advertising the benefits to women in policing. Some police agencies attend recruitment fairs targeted at young women, and ensure female officers are visually represented in their recruitment materials. Additionally, some agencies have adopted physical testing standards that do not discriminate due to height, weight or performance standards that would not affect job performance.

While some female recruitment efforts have seen progress, retention remains a key challenge, and this problem has deeper roots. More women entering a recruit class does not necessarily translate into employees who stay in the service and/or grow their careers. Research suggests that women leave law enforcement employment for specifically identified
reasons, including lack of promotional opportunity and inflexible working arrangements. In the aforementioned CACP study, women officers perceived their organizations to be less supportive than did their male colleagues. This may be an important clue in understanding retention patterns of women in law enforcement. The RCMP has undertaken a gender-based assessment to examine the reasons why women are less likely to be recruited and retained in their organization. Some factors they have identified include gender differences in promotion-seeking behavior, selection bias, work-life balance including mobility, and perceived transparency in the promotional process.

Work-Life Balance:

Low levels of promotion for female officers can be partially attributed to historical and/or current preferences in male-dominated organizations to promote men (commonly known as the glass ceiling or glass pyramid). Without role models in senior management, female officers may also be self-selecting out of a management career track or promotion process. Childcare and family responsibilities, in organizations that lack work-life balance policies, can also affect female officers and their potential desire for promotional opportunities. This can apply to male officers as well, as men take on a more prominent role in family and caregiving.

A study that recently surveyed over 4,000 Canadian police officers found that officers balance heavy work demands with high demands at home. Most officers have children, and many are also caring for elderly parents. Males, regardless of rank, were more likely than women to live in families where their partner has primary responsibility for childcare. On the other hand, female officers at all levels are more likely to live in families where they have primary responsibility for childcare. The study also found that the higher the rank of the police officer, the less likely they were to share primary responsibility for childcare with their partner. Fifty-seven percent of female commands, however, still had primary responsibility for their children. Higher levels of stress were reported by female officers. While levels of stress decreased as rank increased for male officers, this was not the case for female officers. In some organizations that serve a broad geographic area, like the RCMP or the Canadian Armed Forces, promotions often require relocation, which women are less likely to accept because of perceived disruption to their partners’ career or children’s lives. These are all work-life balance issues that can be addressed by adapting the organizational culture and policies.

Violence and Harassment:

Instances of gender-based discrimination and sexual harassment against women in law enforcement agencies in Canada has been documented in the media and academic research. Harassment and violence clearly create an inhospitable work environment. A woman is not likely to enter or stay in an organization in which she could be subject to physical, sexual and emotional abuse. While many police organizations have developed policies to prevent and address workplace harassment, cases continue to surface which suggest that these policies may not have had a substantive effect on changing workplace culture in law enforcement.

Beyond the considerable psychological and emotional impacts of workplace harassment, there are also financial implications for police organizations, primarily including litigation costs associated with harassment suits as well as medical and sick leave costs for victims. Harassment situations are detrimental to the health of workers, the workplace itself and to an employer’s bottom line. While high profile cases have drawn attention to the issue of sexual harassment of women within law enforcement organizations, sexual violence in the workplace occurs in many workplaces. Statistics Canada estimates that 24 per cent of criminal victimization reported in the workplace was sexual assault related, and these numbers are low given that female workplace victimization is less likely to be reported to police than male victimization. These numbers do not take into account non-criminal bullying and harassment allegations.

At the root of these challenges is a need to shift the culture of policing organizations to one of gender inclusivity. This can be achieved by changing policies, procedures and attitudes that are still based in a male-dominated, paramilitary and hierarchical culture.
FOUR WAYS POLICING ORGANIZATIONS BENEFIT FROM REPRESENTATION OF WOMEN

The Power of Collaboration and Community-Oriented Policing

Community-based policing means that police are working in collaboration with other agencies and individuals, and bringing an interpersonal, problem-solving approach to their work. The objective of community-based policing is to be effective in meeting community needs, increasing public trust and confidence in policing, improving co-operation and demonstrating accountability. This paradigm shift at the highest level of policing organizations reflects an ongoing transformation in relationships, particularly with outside agencies as well as with individuals who encounter the justice system.

For this reason, officers require well-developed conflict mediation and interpersonal skills to be effective, rather than relying only on force and strength. Research indicates that the public perceives women to be more effective in diffusing volatile interactions. Female officers also report more support for the principles of community-oriented policing. Interpersonal strengths have not been emphasized as much as physical strength in recruitment and hiring practices. This may contribute to women’s disadvantage in the recruitment process and in career advancement, and produce an organizational deficit with regard to these important skills. Recruiting for, and training on, effective communication and mediation skills will help accelerate the collaborative capacity of policing organizations.

Excessive Use of Force – Liability & Public Accountability

Evidence demonstrates that female officers are much less likely to use excessive force than male officers. One U.S. study showed that female officers were named in only five per cent of citizen complaints for excessive force and two per cent of sustained allegations, despite women representing 12.7 per cent of the police officer population. Other studies showed that male officers used more types of force against offenders. In the Los Angeles Police Department between 1990 and 1999, male officers outnumbered female officers on patrol by a ratio of 4:1. The payouts involving excessive use of force by male officers exceeded those for female officers by a significantly larger ratio of 23:1, up to five and a half times greater for male officers than female officers.

In Canada, depending on the province/territory, use of force allegations could be investigated by police internal professional standards units, provincial oversight bodies such as law enforcement review agencies, and/or civilian-led independent investigation units designed to conduct criminal investigations into serious incidents involving police. Excessive use of force files in these types of agencies range from firearm deaths and injuries to in-custody deaths and injuries. The Alberta Serious Incident Response Team (ASIRT) reported that 50 per cent of its investigations in 2012/2013 were use of force related. Toronto’s Professional Standards Unit reported in 2012 that 2000 use of force reports were submitted (note: these would not necessarily be considered excessive use of force incidents). The same annual report notes that 142 civil actions and potential claims were made against the Toronto Police Service and the Toronto Police Service Board in 2012.

The excessive use of force affects police organizations by exposing them to liability and costly litigation and can compromise public perception about the integrity of police. This is not only important for a police agency’s bottom line and the responsible allocation of public funds, but is also critical to maintaining public trust in law enforcement. In Mexico and Latin America, a female-only traffic unit was employed because they were less likely to accept bribes and engage in corruption.

Changing the Culture of Violence and Harassment against Female Members

Sexual harassment is more likely to take place in a male-dominated workplace. In addition to addressing sexual harassment with those perpetrating it, hiring more women is another approach to reducing exposure to liability in this area. However, solutions lie not just in reducing the ratio of potential harassers to victims. More qualified women in an organization normalize the participation of women. This, in turn, helps break down
traditionally male-dominated cultural divides, attitudes and traditions. Women’s active participation, including in high level and decision-making capacities, also results in shifts in the organization’s culture, bringing diversified skills and leadership styles. Workplaces free from sexual harassment and discrimination are more positive and productive. To transform policing to achieve these ends, men and male leadership need to be central to shifting the workplace culture. Again, it is important to recognize that simply balancing the ratio of women to men is not enough.

The aforementioned CACP research project suggested that women officers were significantly less likely than men to believe that their colleagues would report problematic behavior, despite equal levels of perceived commitment to the organization. This same research also found that perceived organizational support and supportive supervision have a significant impact on the integrity-related behaviour of officers. When management practices demonstrate leadership in these areas and reflect an established set of core values, there is the potential to reduce unethical behavior in the workplace.

Responding to Crimes of Gender-based Violence

Gender-based violence is a serious problem in Canada and includes domestic violence, sexual assault, sexual exploitation and other types of abuse. Police-reported data in 2010 documents almost 99,000 victims of family violence alone, accounting for one-quarter (25 per cent) of all victims of violent crime in Canada. Global data indicate that a higher representation of women in policing results in more and better investigation of gender-based crimes, particularly with regard to supporting victims. The UN Women 2011-2012 Progress of the World’s Women reports on data from 40 countries indicating that where women are present in policing, reporting of sexual assault increases. Regardless of whether this is a result of an increased comfort level for female victims reporting to other females, or because supportive cultures in gender-balanced organizations make them better able to respond, this is an important finding.

A 2003 report from the National Centre for Women in Policing studied the response of male and female officers to domestic violence calls. It found that male officers were less likely than female officers to write a police report when responding to the second domestic violence call at a residence. This could be the result of a knowledge gap on the cycle of violence in domestic violence situations, and a lack of awareness of the number of incidents that generally take place before a woman chooses to leave an abusive relationship. Positive policy shifts have taken place to address discrepancies such as this. For example, in Canada, most police agencies now have a policy that requires reports and action, including follow up for all domestic violence calls. However, many still do not. It is important for male officers to be genuinely engaged in addressing gender-based violence and in particular, in working with male perpetrators of violence.

The issue of officer-involved gender-based violence must also be considered. In 2012-2013, the Nova Scotia Serious Incident Response Team investigated six incidents of officer-involved domestic violence in the province, as well as one officer-involved sexual assault (32 per cent of total investigations). Of all the cases investigated by the unit in that year, only the domestic violence and sexual assault incidents resulted in charges to an officer. In 2012, 16 per cent of ASIRT’s files were officer-involved sexual assaults. Changing hiring and organizational policies to be more attentive to signs of violence in officers, and providing appropriate supports and interventions, are measures to reduce such violence. Again, shifting organizational culture through increasing the representation and participation of women can result in more egalitarian attitudes, perceptions and relationships between men and women that can influence individual behavior.
Outcomes from CACP’s recent research provide insight into some possible ways to move forward on these issues. As mentioned earlier, the research found female officers perceived lower levels of organizational support and believed less so than men that problematic behaviors would be reported. The research also found low levels of perceived procedural fairness in both male and female officers across police organizations. Based on this evidence, the research suggests that improvements to management practices would be beneficial. Specifically, some of CACP’s recommendations included more transparent processes, improved organizational support and communication, as well as developing models for ethical leadership.38

These types of strategies can be further enhanced using a gender-sensitive lens. Some examples could include the development of more transparent processes to deal with allegations of harassment and promotion decisions, consulting with employees and re-assessing organizational policies to ensure they are more supportive of women, and promoting ethical leadership models that include championing gender-inclusivity.

The following areas outline potential approaches for taking a gender-inclusive approach to improving policies, practices, cultures and attitudes. They are based on a review of the literature, emerging Canadian examples, and the input of some key stakeholders in law enforcement. It is important to note this is not intended to be an exhaustive or definitive list of strategies, but a starting point for dialogue and awareness. It is hoped that by stimulating discussion, this list can continue to evolve and be informed by additional examples and reflections from jurisdictions across Canada.

1. **High-Level Commitment to Gender and Diversity Mainstreaming**

Gender and diversity mainstreaming means examining the decisions of an organization at all levels using an analysis that takes into account the diverse needs and experiences of groups of men and women, and the different impacts of such decisions. The goal of a gender-inclusive organization could be established as a high-level corporate objective. There are many tools to help with gender and diversity mainstreaming, including gender and diversity analysis, gender audits, equality impact assessments, etc. Training could be developed to educate high-level gender champions — both men and women — to model commitment and accountability for gender-inclusive leadership. Gender-inclusive leadership means being proactive in analyzing organizational policies and consulting across the organization with men and women of diverse groups on the impact of policies. This could range from human resource policies on promotion and retention, to codes of conduct and complaint mechanisms, to investigative approaches considering the impact of men and women victims and offenders.

Change requires looking at formal policies about hiring practices, flexible scheduling and the like, but it also requires an examination of the informal practices that have become ingrained over time as part of policing culture. This includes things like informal recruiting practices (ex: how officers are invited to apply into specialized units – which often relies on who you know – all the way down to locker room behavior that is not often identified as overtly harassing, but deeply affects who feels welcome in the workplace. This is a separate conversation from formal policy discussions, but is equally important).

---

**INTERNATIONAL EXAMPLES**

- **Gender Self-Assessment Guide for the Police, Armed Forces and Justice Sector**

- **South Wales Single Equality Scheme & Positive Action Strategy**

- **South Wales Policing Authority Equality Impact Assessments**
Analyzing the impact of organizational policies and practices requires hearing from women and men. This could include seeking input from male and female officers in a safe and meaningful way about how they experience the organization and the changes they believe are needed. To ensure confidentiality of potentially sensitive feedback, independent or external consultants could be engaged to support this process.

The goal of analyzing organizational policies and practices is to identify opportunities to change, enhance or mitigate negative implications, and to promote positive actions or active measures to promote equal access and outcomes, not just those that prevent discrimination. Some examples of positive actions to support women could involve enforcing accountability for diversity management, actively seeking out and investing in female candidates for career development and promotion, establishing mentorship opportunities for women and early intervention training for supervisors to identify high-risk attitudes and behaviours that precede gender-based harassment or violence.

Some current Canadian examples of gender and diversity mainstreaming include:

- RCMP Gender-Based Assessment www.rcmp-gcc.gc.ca/aud-ver/reports-reports/gba-eces/gba-eces-eng.htm#a1

2. Improve Work-Life Balance for the Benefit of all Employees

In the previously noted study on work-life balance for Canadian police officers, specific factors were identified which contributed to work-life balance challenges. The following recommendations were made in consideration of these factors. They indicated that the recommendations would help with recruitment, retention, succession planning and workload balance in general:

- Focus on cultural changes within the department, including increasing the number of managers who promote work-life balance policies and who support the shifting of cultural norms in the organization to recognize that sometimes family must take priority over work.
- Identify ways for employees to have more control over their workday and address workload issues by increasing actual and perceived flexibility and control over work hours, giving employees more autonomy and control over their work environment, and reward work completion as opposed to the number of hours worked.

Additional considerations could include assessing maternity, parental and family leave policies, shift scheduling and childcare resources.

INTERNATIONAL EXAMPLES

Victoria Police (AU) Australia - Employee Child Care Needs Project (See Ruth Montgomery, Gender Audits in Policing Organizations for information www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/rc-cr/gapo-ebop/index-eng.html)
3. Look at Gender and Diversity from an Intersectional Approach

Expanding their ability to enhance diversity, including recruiting officers from a range of cultural backgrounds, has been a priority for many police agencies. This important work has resulted in gains to ethnic diversity in policing, including in senior management.\(^{41}\)

An intersectional approach, however, requires a deeper analysis of the social dynamics of identity and difference. It encourages an understanding of how as individuals we have multiple identities based on ethnicity, culture, gender, age, sexuality and ability. These multiple identities intersect, requiring an understanding of the needs and experiences, for example, of Aboriginal men and women, men and women from a variety of ethno-cultural groups, LGBTQ individuals, people with disabilities, etc. Importantly, this includes acknowledging and understanding the present day effects of historical and ongoing oppression, colonization and discrimination, including racism and homophobia, among others.

4. Ensure Oversight and Accountability on Harassment

As has been demonstrated, improving the transparency of investigations into occurrences of harassment or violence is important to women’s perception of safety and security in the organization. Debate exists about the type of mechanisms that would be most appropriate to investigate and discipline harassment behavior within the workplace. Some jurisdictions have adopted civilian-led, external units to investigate officer-involved incidents where a crime may have taken place. This could include a crime against another officer or against a civilian. Other agencies have internal processes in place. Likely, both internal and external mechanisms to deal with misconduct and criminal behavior related to violence and harassment are necessary to ensure transparency and accountability.

Some recent Canadian examples of work-life balance initiatives in policing include:
- Royal Newfoundland Constabulary Maternity, Parental and Adoption Leave “Top up” www.releases.gov.nl.ca/releases/2013/exec/0404n03.htm

Some recent Canadian examples include:
- Vancouver Police Department Car 87 Mental Health Initiative http://vancouver.ca/police/organization/investigation/investigative-support-services/youth-services/community-response.html

INTERNATIONAL EXAMPLE

There are also many interventions, including education and awareness, cultural shifts and disciplinary policy changes that can take place to prevent or enable early intervention, while at the same time building a sense of accountability within the organization that harassment and violence will not be tolerated. For example, some police agencies in other countries have adopted protocols to both prevent and address officer-involved domestic violence.

5. Establish Goals and Measure Progress

A key component of successful gender and diversity mainstreaming in any organization is establishing, tracking and monitoring progress towards pre-determined goals. Beyond just establishing a goal of a percentage increase in female recruits, a more holistic goal would be to create a culture of gender inclusivity within the organization. The indicators to measure this would then go beyond the number of recruits to the number and quality of gender-sensitive policy changes implemented, the number of females entering officer development programs, and the attitude changes measured in supervisors about work-life balance policies after training. Taken together, a fundamental goal of gender inclusivity and specific indicators to measure progress both qualitatively and quantitatively, create a more complete picture of the progress being made.

Importantly, when undertaking gender-sensitive evaluation, critical data sources are the perspectives and experiences of women and other under-represented groups. For example, the input of both male and female officers should be obtained equally (in a safe and meaningful way) to inform the results. For instance, in assessing policies or officer behavior that may affect groups of victims or citizens, their input should be sought, ensuring representative diversity.

Some Canadian approaches include:
- Alberta Serious Incident Response Team
  www.solgps.alberta.ca/programs_and_services/public_security/ASIRT/Pages/default.aspx
- Fredericton Police Department and University of New Brunswick: Understanding the Impact of Intimate Partner Violence: Helping Police Officers to Better Intervene training initiative
  www.unb.ca/fredericton/arts/centres/mmfc/education/police.html
- Nova Scotia Special Investigation Unit
  http://sirt.novascotia.ca/
- RCMP Respectful Workplace Initiative
  www.rcmpvetsnational.ca/General/Meetings/RespectfulWorkplace/RWPActionPlanNov2103.pdf

Some recent Canadian examples of gender-diversity inclusive evaluation and monitoring include:
- Ontario Provincial Police Diversity & Inclusion Strategy Map 2009-2010
  www.opp.ca/ecms/files/270341239.pdf
- RCMP Gender & Respect Action Plan

INTERNATIONAL EXAMPLE:
OSCE Police Public Partnerships Gender Assessment Approach
www.osce.org/gender/36363

Some international examples include:
- International Association of Chiefs of Police Domestic Violence by Police Officers Model Policy
  www.theiacp.org/ViewResult?SearchID=1072

INTERNATIONAL EXAMPLES
- OSCE Police Public Partnerships Gender Assessment Approach
  www.osce.org/gender/36363
- International Association of Chiefs of Police Domestic Violence by Police Officers Model Policy
  www.theiacp.org/ViewResult?SearchID=1072
CONCLUSION

It is hoped that this paper succeeds in highlighting the benefits of diverse policing organizations. The goal of this work is not simply to increase statistical representations of women in police ranks, but to transform policing culture in Canada to be gender and diversity inclusive at all levels of governance and operation, and able to better respond to the dynamic public safety needs of Canadians. It presents ideas to stimulate dialogue and discussion. It is not an exhaustive compilation of best practices, as those are best suited to emerge from the experiences and perspectives of police agencies and other criminal justice organizations across the country. We welcome your ideas, input and strategies to further develop this discussion.

Please direct any comments or input to Manitoba Status of Women at msw@gov.mb.ca.
REFERENCES


10. Note that in Canada, provinces and territories are policed by a combination of federal policing body (the RCMP), provincial police agencies (e.g., Ontario Provincial Police, Sûreté du Québec, Royal Newfoundland Constabulary), municipal police services (e.g., Toronto Police Service, Winnipeg Police Service), and various First Nations policing bodies. These statistics represent the total of all police in a particular jurisdiction.


25 Note that civil liability costs in the U.S. may be substantially more than in Canada due to differences in civil law.
27 Alberta Serious Incident Response Team 2012 A Year in Review www.solgps.alberta.ca/programs_and_services/public_security/ASIRT/Publications/Annual%20Reports/ASIRT%202012%20Annual%20Report.pdf
37 Alberta Serious Incident Response Team 2012 A Year in Review www.solgps.alberta.ca/programs_and_services/public_security/ASIRT/Publications/Annual%20Reports/ASIRT%202012%20Annual%20Report.pdf
41 Ibid